



Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

September 14, 2017

Honorable Andrew M. Cuomo
Governor of New York State
NYS State Capitol Building
Albany, NY 12224

Honorable Thomas P. DiNapoli
Office of the State Comptroller
59 Maiden Lane, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10038

RE: Response to Report #2016-S-11 - NYC Transit: Selected Aspects of Subway Station Safety

Gentlemen:

On June 15, 2017, the Office of the State Comptroller issued the above referenced audit report. As required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, I am providing you with the attached response which addresses the recommendations contained in the report.

A copy of the final audit report is attached for your convenience.

Sincerely,

Joseph J. Lhota
MTA Chairman

c: Donna M. Evans, MTA Chief of Staff
Michael J. Fucilli, Auditor General, MTA Audit Services

Attachment

Memorandum



Date September 13, 2017
To Veronique Hakim, Managing Director
From Darryl Irick, Acting President, NYC Transit *(P)*
Re **New York State Comptroller Report #2016-S-11 Selected Aspects of Subway Station Safety: 90 Day Response**

In response to the requirements of Section 170 of the Executive Law to respond 90 days after receipt of the above-referenced audit report from the State Comptroller, we hereby provide you with steps taken by MTA New York City Transit to implement the recommendations outlined in the audit report and, where recommendations were not implemented, the reasons are set forth below.

The stated purpose of the audit was to determine whether the Division of Station Environment and Operations has taken appropriate steps to make all of its subway stations safe and whether Help Point and Customer Assistance Intercoms ("CAIs") are operational and accessible to all.

Comptroller Recommendation #1: Revisit the subway stations where auditors identified the defects, determine the current condition and take appropriate action. If actions are not required, document the reason why.

NYCT Response: Appropriate action has been taken to address the defects identified in the audit. NYCT did not find any evidence of two defects which were reported as leak related in the Audit. The MTA has launched a comprehensive water management initiative as part of the Subway Action Plan.

Comptroller Recommendation #2: Require Station Supervisors and other Division personnel, as appropriate, to attend refresher training courses emphasizing the importance of conducting thorough subway inspections.

NYCT Response: NYCT continues to emphasize the importance of thoroughly inspecting stations in our introductory training and in our refresher training courses which staff attend every three years.

Comptroller Recommendation #3: Ensure that defects are addressed/repared according to Division bulletins/guidelines. In particular, develop procedures to identify and follow up on defects for which the completion of repair work is overdue.

NYCT Response: In addition to the training noted above which covers the importance of conducting thorough station inspections, NYCT emphasizes the repair and reporting

of defects at regular staff meetings, and in bulletins that are consistently updated (Bulletin 001-17: Reporting Station Defects was issued on January 5, 2017 as an update to NYCT's guidelines and as a reminder to our employees). We are also upgrading our Station Handheld Inspection Program (SHIP) database to an improved Enterprise Asset Management System which will ensure better defect reporting and repair tracking. Any overdue defects are non-safety related, and they are monitored as part of our 72-hour supervisory inspections. Repairs are scheduled according to priority.

Comptroller Recommendation #4: Require Station Supervisors and Superintendents to document subway station inspections adequately.

NYCT Response: NYCT continues to emphasize the importance of properly documenting the inspections in our introductory training and refresher training every three years, and we monitor proper documentation as part of our internal control process.

Comptroller Recommendation #5: Develop and implement formal procedures to document how tests of Help Points/CAIs are to be performed and documented by non-supervisors.

NYCT Response: This recommendation no longer applies as the manual testing of Help Points has been eliminated, effective July 2, 2017, replaced by automated testing. As the Help Points are installed, the CAIs are being phased out. (CAIs continue to be tested as part of station inspection procedures, but testing is not required by non-supervisors).

Comptroller Recommendation #6: Improve the documentation of tests of Help Point/CAIs by recording the pass number of the employee who conducts such tests.

NYCT Response: As stated above, this recommendation no longer applies as the manual testing of Help Points has been eliminated, effective July 2, 2017, replaced by automated testing.

cc: T. Mulligan
N. Renek
D. Jurgens
W. Habersham
S. Hutson
J. Kuhls
M. Hellman
C. Davis
P. Presvelis
V. Ramotar
R. Richardson