REPORT OF EXAMINATION | 2018M-140

Northeast Central School District

Payroll

OCTOBER 2018



Contents

Report Highlights
Payroll
How Do Districts Provide Accurate Compensation and Benefits? 2
District Officials Provided Accurate Compensation and Benefits 2
Conclusion
Appendix A – Response From District Officials
Appendix B – Audit Methodology and Standards
Appendix C – Resources and Services

Report Highlights

Northeast Central School District

Audit Objective

Determine if compensation paid to employees was in accordance with collective bargaining agreements (CBAs) and Board-approved contracts.

Noteworthy Achievements

- Except for a few minor discrepancies, which we discussed with District officials, District officials accurately paid and provided benefits to employees in accordance with CBAs and Board-approved contracts.
- We used a combination of manual and computer assisted auditing techniques (CAATs) to review payroll records for all employees paid during the audit period. District officials established effective payrollrelated policies and procedures to segregate duties and provide oversight.

There were no recommendations as a result of this audit.

District officials generally agreed with our report.

Background

The Northeast Central School
District (District) is located in the
Town of Amenia, in Dutchess
County. The Board of Education
(Board) is responsible for the
general management and control
of the District's financial and
educational affairs.

The Superintendent and the Business Manager are responsible for the District's day-to-day management and the development and administration of the District's budget.

Quick Facts	
Employees	287
Enrollment	737
Compensation Paid for the Audit Period	\$10.9 million

Audit Period

July 1, 2016 - September 29, 2017

Payroll

How Do Districts Provide Accurate Compensation and Benefits?

Employee compensation and benefits are a significant portion of district operating expenditures. A board is responsible for ensuring that employees are paid accurately and provided benefits in accordance with CBAs and individual employee contracts. The superintendent and business manager are responsible for ensuring that a system is in place to pay the agreed upon compensation and benefits and for recording these transactions in the financial system. A well-designed payroll system adequately segregates duties and provides an oversight and review process to ensure that employees are paid board-authorized compensation and benefits and that compensation and benefits are accurately recorded.

District Officials Provided Accurate Compensation and Benefits

District officials ensured the accuracy of compensation and benefits provided to employees. They established policies and procedures to effectively segregate the multiple aspects of the payroll process and provided adequate oversight. For example, timekeeping requires multiple levels of approval and employee pay rates in the financial system are annually compared with Board-approved agreements. Furthermore, payroll audits are conducted annually at the beginning of each year to validate that each employee on payroll exists.

Computer access to various payroll-related accounting functions is limited to those employees who require access to perform their job duties. For example, the human resources clerk is responsible for entering and updating employee information excluding pay rates and the Business Manager is responsible for updating pay rates. Also, timekeeping and supervisory functions are separated from payroll processing. In addition, department heads approve staff-prepared time sheets and the payroll clerk enters information into the system.

Using a combination of manual techniques and CAATs,¹ we reviewed the payroll records of all 287 employees to identify high-risk transactions. This resulted in testing of more than 5,000 checks and direct deposits totaling \$10,904,517. Except for some minor discrepancies, which we discussed with District officials during fieldwork, salaries and wages paid and benefits provided to employees agreed with CBA stipulations and Board-approved contracts.

Conclusion

Compensation paid and benefits provided to employees were in accordance with CBAs and Board-approved contracts. We commend District officials for effectively designing and implementing policies and procedures that ensure the accuracy of compensation and benefits provided to employees.

¹ CAATs enable testing on larger data sets and provide a higher level of accuracy because a greater portion of the population can be examined.

Appendix A: Response From District Officials

WEBUTUCK CENTRAL SCHOOLS

194 Haight Road, P.O. Box 405 Amenia, New York 12501

> Telephone 845-373-4100 Fax 845-373-4102

September 25, 2018

Office of the State Comptroller Newburgh Regional Office 33 Airport Center Drive, Suite 103 New Windsor, NY 12553

RE: Response to Comptroller Audit:

In response to the review conducted by your office, please see the district response:

Thank you for the recent examination of our payroll department to determine that compensation to employees is being handled in accordance with collective bargaining agreements and Board-approved contracts. We are pleased to hear there were no findings and that no corrective action plan is necessary.

The district would like to thank your staff for their professionalism and assistance during this audit process. Please contact me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Cynthia Hawthorne School Business Administrator

The Strength of Webutuck Is In The "We"

Appendix B: Audit Methodology and Standards

We conducted this audit pursuant to Article V, Section 1 of the State Constitution and the State Comptroller's authority as set forth in Article 3 of the New York State General Municipal Law. To achieve the audit objective and obtain valid audit evidence, our audit procedures included the following:

- We used CAATs to review employee salaries and benefits. We obtained data sets from the District's computerized financial database and performed tests using specialized software to identify anomalies and high-risk transactions.
 We reviewed internal controls and procedures over the computerized financial databases to determine whether the information produced by such systems was reliable.
- A significant portion of our testing used electronic accounting data from the District's accounting program. The population consisted of 5,250 payroll checks and direct deposits for 287 employees (all paid employees including part-time and substitutes). As part of our review, we looked at additional pay items and payroll withholdings.
- We used CAATs to calculate pay and perform detailed analyses of actual pay rates to certain employees. We also used CAATs to determine whether multiple types of payments were accurate and whether selected pay recipients were valid employees.
- We interviewed and observed District officials and employees to learn about payroll processing procedures and employee benefits and reviewed CBAs, employment contracts for non-union employees, personnel files, time and attendance records, leave records and other payroll source documents. We also reviewed internal controls over payroll.
- We compared employee Social Security numbers to the Social Security Death Index master file. We reviewed employee addresses outside of a 45-mile school radius, employee addresses with post office boxes or no address, payroll checks with the same check numbers, duplicate employee Social Security numbers and employees using the same bank to determine whether the individuals paid were valid employees. We also reviewed all employee records with the same name, address or phone number.
- We reviewed all payments to key officials and employees who received more than 26 pays during a fiscal year. We also reviewed all longevity payments, health insurance buyout payments, payments made on unscheduled pay dates and payments after employee termination dates.
- We judgmentally selected a sample of 10 balloon payments totaling approximately \$104,900 out of 59 total balloon payments totaling approximately \$751,000. From the payroll records, we categorized payments greater than \$7,000 as balloon payments. We selected all six payments outside the last fiscal payroll cycle and randomly selected four payments

- during the last fiscal payroll cycle totaling \$36,228.90. We reviewed payroll records to determine whether payments were accurate and supported.
- We judgmentally selected 25 rounded dollar amount payments totaling approximately \$94,000 out of 272 rounded dollar amount payments totaling approximately \$820,000. We selected our sample based on dollar amounts and earnings categories. We reviewed payroll records to determine whether payments were accurate and supported.
- We judgmentally selected 61 overtime payments totaling approximately \$12,800 out of 344 total overtime payments totaling approximately \$35,900.
 We selected the highest payment to each of the 36 employees receiving overtime pay and then selected the second highest payment for those employees who received multiple overtime payments for the audit period.
 We reviewed payroll records to determine whether payments were accurate and supported.
- We judgmentally selected the 25 highest paid employees and compared the salary rates paid with Board-approved salary schedules (including stipends), CBAs and Board-approved employment contracts to determine whether these employees were accurately paid.
- We performed data reliability tests, which included evaluating the propriety
 of all manual checks written in our audit period and all gaps in payroll check
 sequence numbers. We also tested the propriety of all voided checks in our
 audit period.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with GAGAS (generally accepted government auditing standards). Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

Unless otherwise indicated in this report, samples for testing were selected based on professional judgment, as it was not the intent to project the results onto the entire population. Where applicable, information is presented concerning the value and/or size of the relevant population and the sample selected for examination.

Appendix C: Resources and Services

Regional Office Directory

www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/regional_directory.pdf

Cost-Saving Ideas – Resources, advice and assistance on cost-saving ideas www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/costsavings/index.htm

Fiscal Stress Monitoring – Resources for local government officials experiencing fiscal problems www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/fiscalmonitoring/index.htm

Local Government Management Guides – Series of publications that include technical information and suggested practices for local government management www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/pubs/listacctg.htm#lgmg

Planning and Budgeting Guides – Resources for developing multiyear financial, capital, strategic and other plans www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/planbudget/index.htm

Protecting Sensitive Data and Other Local Government Assets – A non-technical cybersecurity guide for local government leaders www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/lgli/pdf/cybersecurityguide.pdf

Required Reporting – Information and resources for reports and forms that are filed with the Office of the State Comptroller www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/finreporting/index.htm

Research Reports/Publications – Reports on major policy issues facing local governments and State policy-makers www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/researchpubs/index.htm

Training – Resources for local government officials on in-person and online training opportunities on a wide range of topics www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/academy/index.htm

Contact

Office of the New York State Comptroller Division of Local Government and School Accountability 110 State Street, 12th Floor, Albany, New York 12236

Tel: (518) 474-4037 • Fax: (518) 486-6479 • Email: localgov@osc.ny.gov

www.osc.state.ny.us/localgov/index.htm

Local Government and School Accountability Help Line: (866) 321-8503

NEWBURGH REGIONAL OFFICE – Tenneh Blamah, Chief Examiner

33 Airport Center Drive, Suite 103 • New Windsor, New York 12553-4725

Tel (845) 567-0858 • Fax (845) 567-0080 • Email: Muni-Newburgh@osc.ny.gov

Serving: Columbia, Dutchess, Greene, Orange, Putnam, Rockland, Ulster, Westchester

counties





Like us on Facebook at facebook.com/nyscomptroller Follow us on Twitter @nyscomptroller