

2 Broadway  
New York, NY 10004  
212 878-7000 Tel

Thomas F. Prendergast  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer



## Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

October 30, 2015

Ms. Carmen Maldonado  
Audit Director  
The Office of the State Comptroller  
Division of State Government Accountability  
59 Maiden Lane, 21<sup>st</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10038

**Re: Final Report #2014-F-10 (Metropolitan Transportation Authority – Subway Service Diversions for Maintenance and Capital Projects)**

Dear Ms. Maldonado:

This is in reply to your letter requesting a response to the above-referenced final report.

I have attached for your information the comments of Jim Ferrara, Interim President, NYC Transit, which address this report.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'T. Prendergast', written over a horizontal line.

Thomas F. Prendergast  
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer

C: Donna M. Evans  
MTA Chief of Staff

Attachments

*The agencies of the MTA*

MTA New York City Transit  
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Metro-North Railroad  
MTA Bridges and Tunnels

MTA Capital Construction  
MTA Bus Company


# Memorandum



New York City Transit

Date October 23, 2015

To Thomas F. Prendergast, Chairman and Chief Executive Officer

From Jim Ferrara, Interim President, NYC Transit 

Re **Subway Service Diversions for Maintenance and Capital Projects Report  
2014-F-10**

In response to the State Comptroller's letter regarding the Audit report referenced above, the following are our specific responses to the "Not Implemented" or "Partially Implemented" recommendations:

***Recommendation 1 (Alternate Solution):** Monitor actual expenditures for service diversions and document the justification and supporting analysis for any spending over budgeted amounts.*

Response: Costs for Diversions continue to be tracked on a project basis. The reason for this is that Diversions are often shared across projects and often include maintenance work. As multiple units utilize single Diversions, it is more accurate to review Diversion costs against budget over the lifespan of a project.

In its efforts to continue to control costs, the Department of Subways is developing multiple systems to provide enhanced data on cost drivers for Diversions. Currently under development, the Construction Flagging Request Module is an example of such a project. This module will provide the department with lifecycle data on the number of Construction Flaggers requested and the fulfillment rate of those requests. With this data, the Department intends to streamline operations and realize efficiencies in overall work planning and resource allocation.

***Recommendation 2 (Partially Implemented):** Ensure that daily schedule start and end times for service diversions are adhered to by assigned staff, and commence subway service as soon as possible after diversions are completed.*

Response: The Rail Control Center General Order (GO) Worksheet is currently being digitized to provide additional data regarding GO call on times and GO clear times. This new digital format will provide data for the analysis of GO start and end times, and lead to initiatives that will allow GO's to start closer to their

scheduled start time and for service to commence as soon as possible after diversions are completed. These projects are expected to contribute to implementation of this recommendation.

*Recommendation 4 (Partially Implemented): Adhere to federal law and Transit procedures related to communicating with the public regarding diversions.*

NYCT has developed a Language Assistance Plan (LAP) as part of its Title VI program. The LAP outlines the procedure for translation of service changes. The selection of languages to be translated depends on the language needs of the affected population and/or the identified most common languages within NYCT service area. The LAP is awaiting approval by the FTA.

The report mentions that auditors surveyed 29 stations in 2015 and found that some of the stations did not have street level signage and one station did not have any signs posted. NYC Transit posts signs at different station locations depending on the impact of the service diversion on the station (see attached for the station posting guidelines). Without knowing exactly which stations the surveyors visited and which diversions they were investigating, it is impossible to know whether service diversion signs were missing. Prior to the auditors issuing their findings, an email conversation between our Marketing Division and the auditors indicated that the auditors had focused their survey on three stations on February 13, 2015 - Fulton Center, Brooklyn Bridge (4/5/6), and Chambers St. (3/5). There were no service plans scheduled that would have directly impacted those stations the following weekend. However, the auditors may have seen signs that were up from the previous night, when 3 trains were running via the 6 to W 4 St, and 5 trains were not running south of Brooklyn Bridge. There was also a cold weather plan issued on February 13, which might explain why auditors say they saw signs posted for service changes occurring the same day. NYC Transit posts notices when cold weather plans require curtailment of 3 express service.

Attachment

cc: J. Leader  
P. Fleuranges  
M. Chubak

Planned Service Changes, Customer Information

Impact of the planned service change on the station	Station Posting Locations					Comments
	Street Level	Control Areas	Entrance to Platforms	Transfer corridors in station	Platform	
Trains not stopping at station, no alternative service on same track	X			X	X	"No uptown 1 trains at this station. For uptown service, take a downtown 1 to 72 St and transfer to an uptown 1"
Trains not stopping at station, alternative service available on same track					X	"No uptown C trains at this station. Take the E instead. C service is available at W 4 St"
Trains stopping at station on a different track, same platform					X	"B trains stop at the express track and run express to 36 St"
Trains stopping at a different platform, same or different track			X	X	X	"Flushing-bound 7 trains stop on the Manhattan-bound platform on the center track"
Train recovered after station, alternative service available at same station					X	"Brooklyn-bound A trains are rerouted via the F - Near stop 8 Way - Lafayette St - For Spring Canal, and Chambers St, take the E"
Minor diversion on same line, not impacting the station directly					X	Overview signs (usually with maps) alert passengers to significant diversions farther down the line. E.g., "No F service between 31 St - MetroTech and Church Av. Free shuttle buses and B trains provide alternate service"
Trains terminate at the station. Passengers need to transfer to shuttle bus	X		X	X	X	Street level signs tell passengers which trains are running in which direction. Wayfinding arrows direct passengers from the station to the shuttle bus
Planned service changes on adjacent line that do not run through the station		X				System-wide listings of all planned service changes are posted on a weekly basis in station control areas