

2 Broadway  
New York, NY 10004  
212 878-7000 Tel

**Joseph J. Lhota**  
Chairman



## Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

May 14, 2018

Honorable Andrew M. Cuomo  
Governor of New York State  
NYS State Capitol Building  
Albany, NY 12224

Honorable Thomas P. DiNapoli  
Office of the State Comptroller  
59 Maiden Lane, 31<sup>st</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10038

RE: Response to Report #2016-S-78 – MTA LIRR Utilization of the Arch Street Yard and Shop Facility

Gentlemen:

On December 8, 2017, the Office of the State Comptroller issued the above referenced audit report. As required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, I am providing you with the attached response which addresses the recommendations contained in the report.

A copy of the final audit report is attached for your convenience.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Joseph J. Lhota".

Joseph J. Lhota

c: Helene Fromm, MTA Chief of Staff  
Michael J. Fucilli, Auditor General, MTA Audit Services

Attachment

*The agencies of the MTA*

MTA New York City Transit  
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Metro-North Railroad  
MTA Bridges and Tunnels

MTA Capital Construction  
MTA Bus Company

Jamaica Station  
Jamaica, NY 11435-4380  
718 558-8254 Tel  
718 657-9047 Fax

Phillip Eng  
President



May 7, 2018

Mr. Joseph J. Lhota  
Chairman  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority  
2 Broadway  
New York, NY 10004

Re: MTA LIRR Utilization of the Arch Street Yard and Shop Facility  
Report 2016-S-78

Dear Chairman Lhota:

As required by Section 170 of the Executive Law, detailed below are the updated actions that have been taken to address the recommendation contained in the above-referenced audit report. The report contained one recommendation. Our response, dated October 6, 2017, indicated that the LIRR had consistently used the Arch Street Yard and Shop Facility ("Facility") and had a plan to occupy and utilize the Facility from the present until the completion of the East Side Access Project ("ESA Opening Day").

**Recommendation No. 1**

Perform a written cost-benefit analysis to determine what the best use is for the Facility and the equipment until ESA is open.

**LIRR Implementation Status: Implemented**

As indicated in our October 6, 2017 response, the LIRR continues to mobilize for its intended occupation of the Facility from the date Metro-North Railroad Positive Train Control is completed in November 2018 until ESA Opening Day. While the scope of the intended use of the Facility has not changed, the projected usage dates have been updated based on further analysis of outstanding projects, the needs of LIRR and the best use of the Facility. As critical milestone projects were achieved, the LIRR was able to more accurately reflect usage dates. The LIRR has determined that the most efficient use of the Facility is to utilize it for the following:

*The agencies of the MTA*

MTA New York City Transit  
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Metro-North Railroad  
MTA Bridges and Tunnels


MTA Capital Construction  
MTA Bus Company

Mr. Joseph J. Lhota  
Chairman  
May 7, 2018  
Page two

- M9 car modification work is expected to take place between September 2018 and 2022.
- Commissioning of ESA Rescue Locomotive and the LIRR/New York Atlantic Rail work locomotives is expected to take place between December 2020 and February 2022.
- M9A car testing and commissioning is expected to take place between April 2022 and July 2024.
- Wheel Truing machine located in the Facility is expected to be used as part of an ongoing annual process for potential back log of out-of-service equipment, if any.
- Equipment on legal hold pending investigative review is expected to be stored at the Facility.

The above noted items are part of the LIRR's formal and approved plan which we believe addresses the recommendation of the New York State Comptroller's Office. Please contact me should you require additional information.

Sincerely,

  
Phillip Eng  
President