



Metropolitan Transportation Authority

State of New York

October 24, 2019

Ms. Carmen Maldonado
Audit Director
The Office of the State Comptroller
Division of State Government Accountability
59 Maiden Lane, 21st Floor
New York, NY 10038

Re: Final Report #2019-F-8 (Selected Safety and Security Equipment at Train Stations)

Dear Ms. Maldonado:

This is in reply to your letter requesting a response to the above-referenced final report.

I have attached for your information the comments of Andy Byford, President, MTA NYC Transit, which address this report.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Pat Foye".

Patrick J. Foye
Chairman and Chief Executive Officer

c: Helene Fromm, MTA Chief of Staff
Michele Woods, Acting Auditor General, MTA Audit Services

The agencies of the MTA

MTA New York City Transit
MTA Long Island Rail Road

MTA Metro-North Railroad
MTA Bridges and Tunnels

MTA Capital Construction
MTA Bus Company

Memorandum



Date October 18, 2019

To Patrick J. Foye, Chairman, MTA

From Andy Byford, President, NYC Transit

Re **New York State Comptroller Report #2019-F-8 (Follow-Up Report) – Selected Safety and Security Equipment at Train Stations (SIR)**

This information is being provided in response to the State Comptroller's final audit report on Selected Safety and Security Equipment at Train Stations for the Staten Island Railway (2019-F-8). The stated purpose of this follow-up audit was to assess the extent of implementation, as of August 9, 2019, of the two recommendations included in their initial report (2017-S-84, issued April 12, 2018).

Comptroller Recommendation #1: Develop a repair frequency standard and ensure compliance with preventive maintenance and repair frequency standards.

Status: Partially Implemented

NYCT Response: As previously reported, upon achieving beneficial use of the system, SIR developed formal preventative maintenance standards. Such maintenance schedules are based on manufacturer recommendations, component age, and operating conditions. SIR sets an aggressive preventative maintenance (PM) schedule optimizing a balance between the available workforce and equipment reliability. For the audit period, 77 percent of CCTV PMs and 69 percent of local camera PMs were completed within the targeted standard. Staff availability and more urgent priorities, such as equipment repairs may require a reallocation of staff to ensure the security of customers and employees. If a PM is delayed, it is based on an informed decision with minimal impact to operations. SIR is revising the standards to include a grace period of 7 working days to codify this effective and efficient operating practice which takes into account such factors and prioritization. A review of year-to-date 2019 PM data indicates that over 98 percent of CCTV PMs and 100 percent of local camera PMs were completed within 7 days of the standard.

Comptroller Recommendation #2: Clarify whether the newly developed inspection and preventive maintenance procedures includes CAIs.

Status: Implemented

NYCT Response: The audit noted that SIR officials clarified that Customer Assistance Intercoms (CAIs) were included in the maintenance procedure.