



Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

ANDREW M. CUOMO
Governor

ERIK KULLESEID
Commissioner

March 12, 2021

Mr. Brian Reilly
Audit Director
Office of the State Comptroller
110 State Street
Albany, NY 12236-0001

Dear Mr. Reilly:

The Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPRHP) has reviewed the Office of the State Comptroller's (OSC) final report 2019-S-65 (Report), titled "Compliance With Executive Order 95 (Open Data)," which was conducted to determine if ORPHP is complying with Executive Order 95 (EO95), including providing, in a timely manner, publishable state data to the Office of Information Technology Services under EO95, and whether data posted under EO95 is reliable and easily usable. Our responses to the recommendations contained in OSC's report are enclosed.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Erik Kulleseid".

Erik Kulleseid
Commissioner
Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation

**Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation
Response to the Office of the State Comptroller
Final Report 2019-S-65
Compliance with Executive Order 95**

Recommendation 1: As soon as practicable, submit to ITS and make publicly available a complete catalogue and schedule of publishable State data for addition to Open Data.

OPRHP Response August 28, 2020 to 201-S-65: We agree with this recommendation. The Open Data Handbook provided by ITS notes that, “agencies should identify those datasets that are high value, high quality and complete.” OPRHP has not identified all publishable datasets and, therefore, does not have a complete catalogue published. OPRHP currently has 22 data sets posted on the Open Data Website. OPRHP will implement the procedures outlined below in response to OSC’s second recommendation. The datasets identified by those procedures will then be evaluated using the guidelines in the Open Data Handbook. Datasets deemed to meet the criterion identified in EO 95 and the Open Data Handbook will be communicated to ITS and published to the Open Data Website.

In addition, while OPRHP has updated its datasets, some of the datasets were updated on an as-needed basis, depending on the nature of the dataset (e.g., snowmobile trails which are relatively static). Additionally, the nature of other datasets does not lend them to frequent updates, and they were, therefore, updated on an annual basis (e.g., concessions contracts). OPRHP will create a master schedule for updating datasets, that will clarify those datasets that will be updated as they change. As OPRHP identifies new publishable datasets we will update the master schedule, taking into consideration the value of the data to the public and the effort to collect and maintain the datasets.

OPRHP Implementation as of March 1, 2021. OPRHP has updated its schedule for updating datasets, see attached. OPRHP will continue to update the schedule, as datasets are identified for publication.

Recommendation 2: Develop policies and procedures for incorporating Open Data and compliance with EO95 into Parks’ Core business and planning strategies.

OPRHP Response August 28, 2020 to 2019-S-65 draft report: OPRHP agrees with this recommendation. OPRHP was not a data driven Agency when Executive Order 95 was issued in 2013 and OPRHP perceived it had little data that was considered “high value,” as defined by ITS. ITS notes in its Open Data Handbook that high value data is data that can be, “used to increase the agency’s accountability and responsiveness, improve public knowledge of the agency and its operations, further the mission of the agency, create economic opportunity, or respond to a need or demand after public consultation.” Since 2013, however, OPRHP has invested in and deployed various technologies and programs that have increased data available to the Agency. OPRHP has not taken steps to inventory or assess the value, quality or completeness of this data to determine suitability for publishing to the Open Data Website

OPRHP will implement two methods to identify and evaluate additional datasets. Additionally, OPRHP has drafted a program guidance document to memorialize the processes for identifying

and evaluating data for EO 95 compliance. The program guidance document, once officially circulated for review and approval, will be posted to OPRHP's intranet. The two methods identified to determine datasets include:

- A biennial survey of OPRHP Bureau Directors; and
- Development through OPRHP's Lean program.

OPRHP has drafted a survey, using guidelines outlined for dataset identification in the Open Data Handbook. The survey questions and timelines for survey completion are outlined in the draft program guidance document. Additionally, OPRHP's Internal Control Officer, who is charged with implementing the agency's Lean program, agreed to include identification of potential publishable datasets as a program objective.

Once data has been identified by either of the noted methods the Data Coordinator will assess and prioritize the data with the help of the Bureau Director and/or Lean team to determine if the data set identified is publishable State data. The Data Coordinator will use the Open Data Handbook as a guide to evaluating data based on the standards set forth in Executive Order 95.

OPRHP Implementation as of March 1, 2021: OPRHP has finalized a policy, entitled "Implementation and Compliance of Executive Order 95" to ensure greater compliance with EO95 as prescribed in the Report. The policy along with related forms, the Executive Order, and the Open Data Handbook have been posted to OPRHP's intranet. As noted in OPRHP's response to the draft report the methods of identifying data will include a biennial survey of OPRHP's Bureau Directors and development through the Lean program.

The survey has been finalized and was distributed to OPRHP Bureau Directors on October 20, 2020. One such identified dataset, beach water quality survey results, has been selected for public posting to Open Data and is currently completing the internal approval process. Further datasets can be added once identified.

OPRHP's Internal Control Officer, who is charged with implementing the agency's Lean program, has included identification of potential publishable datasets as a program objective. The Internal Control Officer has completed the Kaizen for two Lean initiatives and included EO95 as part of the Lean process.

In addition, the Data Coordinator has reviewed FOIL requests to determine what datasets are routinely requested through FOIL.

Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation
Response to Office of the State Comptroller - Attachment
Final Report 2019-S-65
Compliance with Executive Order 95

Name	Data Type	Agency	Update Schedule	Last Update	Created
Annual Attendance at State Park Facilities Chart: Beginning 2003	chart	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	2/2/2021	3/6/2014
Boat Launch Sites by State Parks or Marine Facility	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Biennially	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
Campgrounds by County Outside Adirondack & Catskill Forest Preserve	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
Golf Courses	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
National Register of Historic Places	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	2/3/2021	2/19/2013
New York State Parks Concession Contracts	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	12/10/2020	1/30/2014
State Historic Sites	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
State Nature Centers	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
State Park Annual Attendance Figures by Facility: Beginning 2003	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	2/3/2021	3/6/2014
State Park Facility Points	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/15/2013
State Park Facility Cumulative Attendance Figures for the Period Beginning 2003	filter	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	2/2/2021	3/6/2014
State Park Facility Points with Playgrounds	filter	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Biennially	12/30/2019	12/18/2013
Boat Launch Sites by State Parks or Marine Facility Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Biennially	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
Campgrounds by County Outside Adirondack & Catskill Forest Preserve Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
Golf Courses Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
National Register of Historic Places Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	2/3/2021	1/12/2015
State Historic Sites Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
State Nature Centers Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
State Park Facilities Points Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	As needed	12/7/2020	2/26/2013
State Park Facility Points with Playgrounds Map	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Biennially	12/7/2020	12/18/2013
State Park Trails	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Biennially	12/7/2020	12/24/2014
Statewide Snowmobile Trail System	map	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	12/7/2020	2/11/2014
State Beach Water Testing Results	dataset	Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, Office of	Annually	PENDING	PENDING